SUMMARIES

of

1. ABHINAVAGUPTA
   AN HISTORICAL AND PHILOSOPHICAL STUDY.
   Second Edition 1963.
2. COMPARATIVE ÆSTHETICS VOL. I
   INDIAN ÆSTHETICS.
   Second Edition 1959.
3. COMPARATIVE ÆSTHETICS VOL. II
   WESTERN ÆSTHETICS. 1956
4. BHĀSKARĪ VOL. III, AN ENGLISH TRANSLATION

of

THE ĪŚVARA PRATYABHIJÑĀ VIMARŚINĪ

with

AN OUTLINE OF HISTORY OF ŚAIVA PHILOSOPHY

by

Dr. K. C. Pandey,
M. A., Ph. D., D. Litt., M. O. L., Shastri
U. G. C. Professor of Sanskrit
Lucknow University.

Residential Address
Fyzabad Road
Babuganj Crossing
Lucknow (India)

100

To be had of
The Chowkhamba Sanskrit Series Office,
Post Box No. 8,
Varanasi-1. (India)

ABHINAVAGUPTA

AN HISTORICAL AND PHILOSOPHICAL STUDY

Second Edition

In the present edition an offset picture of Abhinavagupta and four new chapters have been added. It gives a more complete account of his life, works and historical background of his thought.

The authenticity of the picture in paint lies in its being a faithful representation of the pen-picture, drawn by his pupil, Madhurāja Yogin, who was present at the celebration of the 'recognition' of Abhinavagupta as the spiritual head of all the Śaiva sects by the contemporary great spiritualists, both male and female,

The picture has a religio-philosophical significance; because it presents him as a typical follower of the Kula system. Two 'Dūtīs', each with a jar of Śiva-Rasa, a kind of intoxicant, in the right hand and a lotus-flower and a citron-fruit in the left, are waiting upon him and dance, song and music are going on in front of him; but his mind, being in touch with the Reality, is experiencing the spiritual bliss, and the expression of his eyes stands as a witness to it. For, the characteristic feature of the Kaulism is that it denies antagonism between sensuous joy and spiritual bliss (Ānanda); recognises the former to be a means to the latter; and emphatically asserts that it is meant for the few, who are highly proficient in the Rāja-Yoga as distinct from the Haṭha-Yoga, who have such a control over the mind that they can withdraw it from the stimulating object even at a time when it is being enjoyed most and concentrate it on the tip of Suṣumṇā.

It has an æsthetic significance. Abhinavagupta is a well recognised authority on Śaivaism in general and on poetics, dramaturgy, music, æsthetics and the three monistic systems of the Śaiva philosophy, dealt with in the present edition, in particular, on account of the 48 works which his powerful

pen produced. The picture presents him as a practical musician, playing upon Nāda-Vīṇā, a stringed instrument, capable of producing the original musical sound, called Nāda, and experiencing the transcendental bliss (Ānanda). It shows that his assertion that the sensuous aspect of a work of fine art leads an æsthete, who possesses the necessary subjective conditions, to the highest level of perfect bliss through the imaginative, emotive and Kathartic levels, is based upon his personal experience.

It has an historical importance; because it presents an important event in the history of Sanskrit Literature in so far as it presents Abhinavagupta explaining the sections on music in the Nāṭya Śāstra of Bharata to his pupils, Kṣemarāja etc., who are attentively listening to him and are taking down the words of the master : and also because it reflects a very important religio-philosophical movement in the 10th century A. D.

The pictorial art can present just one moment of life of its object of presentation which the pictorial genius conceives to be the most important visual aspect, inasmuch as it reflects the inner being in a way that suggests the state of consciousness, self or Ātman. Accordingly the central fact, presented in the picture, is the expression of the eyes, which suggests the rest of the self in itself, the experience of the Self of Itself (Svātmaparāmarśa).

PART I

Chapter I. It points out that there were two Abhinavaguptas of historical fame. One of them was a Śākta contemporary of Śaṅkarācārya and belonged to Kāmarūpa (Assam). The other Abhinavagupta, who is the subject of study in this book, was a Śaiva and belonged to Kashmir. He lived and worked during the period from the 2nd half of the 10th to the 1st quarter of the 11th century A. D. This Abhinavagupta is a well recognised authority on Śaivaism in general and on poetics, dramaturgy, music, æsthetics and the three monistic systems of Śaiva philosophy, dealt with in the present edition of the book.

He was born in a noble and learned Śaiva Brāhmaṇa family in Kashmir. He was a man of noble character and enlightened

intellect. He had a thorough knowledge of all Śāstras and made a lasting contribution to both poetics and philosophy.

Chapter II. It opens with a list of Forty-eight works of Abhinavagupta, known from various sources; discusses their chronological order; points out that there were three clearly marked periods in the literary activity of Abhinavagupta and accordingly divides the works into three periods--the Tāntrika, the Ālaṅkārika and the philosophical.

Chapter III. It discusses the problem--which of the three systems,--Krama, Kula, Pratyabhijñā--on which Abhinavagupta wrote, is epitomised in the Paryanta Pañcāśikā. It gives the idea of each verse of the book, discusses means to final emancipation, presented in it, and the thirty seventh category, accepted here.

Chapter IV. There are very few poetic productions in the vast Sanskrit literature, which present so many problems as does the Ghaṭakarpara Kulaka. This chapter attempts to solve them in the light, thrown on them by Abhinavagupta's commentary, the Vivṛti, on it. It shows that the poem "Ghaṭakarpara" does not simply reverse the "motif of the Meghadūta by making a love-lorn lady, in the rainy season, send a message to her lover" : that the word "Kulaka", which is an essential part of the title of the poem, according to Abhinavagupta, does not mean a set of five or more verses with only one finite verb, as it is ordinarily understood to mean : on the contrary, it means a type of musical poetic composition (Gīta-Kāvya)--consisting of a group of songs, which presents one theme and, therefore, the members of which are well connected with one another,--meant for presentation on the stage in a manner different from that of a drama inasmuch as in it singing, acting and dance follow one another : that such poems were not only being composed but also were being staged at the time of Abhinavagupta : that it belongs to the highest type of poetry inasmuch as it is highly suggestive, as has been pointed out by Abhinavagupta in his commentary : that the repetition of different groups of letters (Yamaka) in it is not a sign of laboured composition, nor is its condemnation by our

contemporaries as a low type of poetry justifiable, in the light of Abhinavagupta's critical estimate of it, which seems to have anticipated such an adverse criticism: that, according to Abhinavagupta, who follows the Kashmirian tradition about it, it is from the pen of Kālidāsa and that the status of Kālidāsa as the topmost poet is not adversely affected by this poem; for, the use of Yamakas in it gives such a musical value to it as enhances its emotional and æsthetic value. The Kashmirian tradition about Kālidāsa's authorship of the Ghaṭakarpara Kulaka seems to be supported by the fact that in the Mālavikāgnimitra, the musical poetic composition of Śarmiṣṭhā is a poem of this type.

Chapter V. It explains in detail the historical background of Tāntrika, dramaturgic and philosophical thoughts and ideas of Abhinavagupta.

Chapter VI. It brings out the importance and influence of Abhinavagupta; deals with some of the important writers who were his pupils and were influenced by him in their writings or wrote learned commentaries on his works. Among them Kṣemarāja, Madhurāja Yogin, Jayaratha and Bhāskara Kaṇṭha are specially mentioned.

PART II

Chapters I—V. They give an elaborate account of the Trika or Pratyabhijñā system. It is called Trika, (i) because it accepts the authority of three Āgamas or Tantras—Siddhā, Nāmaka and Mālinī; (ii) because it accepts three triads and deals with all of them; (iii) because it explains all the three aspects of knowledge viz. absolute oneness (Abheda) predominant oneness (Bhedābheda) and duality (Bheda) in the light of its monistic theory. It is known as "Pratyabhijñā", because it considers Pratyabhijñā or recognition, i. e. realisation of the truth about God, world and self, to be the end of philosophy and the means of liberation.

According to the Pratyabhijñā system as explained by Abhinavagupta, the world of experience is not the creation of God out of matter or material atoms; nor is it an evolute of

Prakṛti; nor a stream of mental states or ideas; nor even an unreal appearance or mere illusion. On the other hand, it holds that the world is a manifestation of the all-inclusive universal consciousness or the Supreme Self, called Maheśvara. But it is ideal because it is nothing but an experience of the Self and has its being in the Self exactly as our ideas have their being in us. So the Pratyabhijñā system is described as 'Ābhāsa Vāda', and is referred to as "Realisic Idealism" in modern philosophical terminology.

The main positions of the Pratyabhijñā system may be very briefly stated thus : God, the Supreme Lord (Maheśvara) is the Supreme Self who is eternally free, self-manifesting and blissful. He is both immanent and transcendent in relation to the world of many things and conscious beings or selves. He is present in everything and manifested everywhere in the universe. He manifests all things in and by the light of his eternal, universal consciousness. The creation of the world is the Supreme Lord's manifestation of Himself to Himself, like a reflection of God in a mirror which also is God Himself. The individual self as conscious, active and free is really identical with the Supreme Lord. Although the self is intrinsically free and divine, it becomes liable to limitation and bondage through the influence of ignorance. Hence ignorance means imperfect knowledge and stands, not for any intellectual deficiency, but for the positive Malas or impurities which cover the soul and are responsible for its transmigration. Hence to attain liberation from bondage the self must become free from all impurities and realise its essential identity with the Supreme Lord. It is the clear recognition (pratyabhijñā) of the identity of his self with the Supreme Self that leads man to liberation—a state of perfect freedom, peace, amity and bliss.

The categories of the Ābhāsavāda, the Pratyabhijñā theory of knowledge and theories of effectability, causality and Karma have been presented in detail and their distinctions from those of other systems have been pointed out.

Chapter VI. It presents the Krama system in a proper historical perspective and gives an account of the literature on

and of the exponents of it. It is a monistic system. Like the dualistic--cum--monistic Śaiva system, propounded by Lakulīśa and known as Lakulīśa Pāśupata, it has a pentadic tendency: it thinks in terms of groups of five concepts or postulates. Accordingly the basic pentad, which represents the five forms in which the Absolute manifests itself, consists of the five, Vyomavāmeśvarī etc. and the aspects of speech, which are recognised to be three by Bhartṛhari in his Vākyapadīyam, four by Somānanda in his Śiva Dṛṣṭi, are admitted to be five, adding Sūkṣmā to the generally recognised four, Parā, Paśyantī, Madhyamā and Vaikharī. It is a Śākta system, not only in its ritualistic aspect, in which it enjoins the use of wine, woman and meat, but also in its philosophical aspect inasmuch as it recognises the Ultimate Metaphysical Principle to be Kālī and advocates the following of the Śāktopāya for the realisation of the Reality. It asserts that the ethical value of an action is entirely determined by the motive. Hence the use of the prohibited, such as wine etc., in the ritual does not mean moral turpitude, because the motive in it is not the satisfaction of the senses, but the realisation of the Real.

Chapter VII. It deals with the Kula system. It traces the history of the system from the 5th century A. D., when it was propagated by Macchanda alias Mīna, to the 18 century A. D. when Bhāskara Rāya wrote his commentary on the Nityāṣoḍaśikārṇava in Kāśī (Vārāṇasī). It gives an account of the vast literature on it in an historical order, though most of it is known from Abhinava's references only.

The Kaulism is a difficult system of philosophy. It has been recognised as such by Abhinavagupta himself. Its chief contribution is the conception of "Anuttara", a word, which has been interpreted in twenty-two different ways to bring out the full philosophical significance of it. It synthesizes the Śaivaism and the Śāktism and holds the Ultimate Reality to be the unity of Anuttara and Anuttarā, in which the plurality is as absent as in the first letter of the Devanāgarī alphabetical system "a" (अ) in such instances as "Sīmanta" in which the following "a" at the beginning of "Anta" becomes one with the preceding, at the

end of the word "Sīma", according to Pāṇini's aphorism "Atoguṇe."

It is, therefore, a monistic system. It was very much influenced in its development by the philosophy of language, propounded by the philosophers of language like Nandikeśvara, Pāṇini, Patañjali, Bhartṛhari, Vṛṣabha, Puṇyarāja, Helārāja etc. It gives the philosophy of the letters of the Devanāgarī alphabetical system, in a way which has close similarity with that of the letters of the fourteen aphorisms in the beginning of Pāṇini's system, given earliar by Nandikeśvara. It spread, not only all over India, including the South, but over China also and influenced the Buddhism. Its Tantric aspect got so firmly rooted in China that sages from India went there to learn the Kaulika practices.

Mahamahopadhyaya Dr. Ganganath Jha, Ex-Vice-Chancellor, Allahabad University.

The book is a mine of information, not only in regard to the philosophical system itself but also in regard to the historical aspect of it. In this latter aspect, your work is a distinct improvement upon the work of older Indian Scholars like myself. I congratulate you on this improvement upon our work.

Dr. S. Radhakrishnan, Ex-Vice-Chancellor, Andhra University.

I have glanced through your work and am *impressed by its learning and sound judgement.* Your investigations are bound to redound to the credit of Indian Scholarship.

Dr. S. N. Dasgupta, Ex-Principal, Sanskrit College, Calcutta.

It is a work of rare scholarship and devotion to the subject of his work and will remain as a standard work of reference and study for all those who may work in this extremely interesting phase of Śaivaism which has been rather neglected by anglo-Sanskrit scholars and Pandits alike.

Prof. W. E. Hocking, Harvard University, U. S. A.

I am convinced of its worth as a contribution to literature in English of this school.

Prof. Edgar S. Brightman, Boston University, U. S. A.

The book is the result of extremely scholarly research. Philosophically it is manifestly a work of high order. The special type of idealistic realism and voluntarism which it sets forth is most interesting.

ORIENTAL

LITERARY DIGEST

January 1939

Considering these and other difficulties, the measure of success which Dr. Pandey has achieved is remarkable, and bears testimony to his enthusiasm, earnestness and perseverence. As a pioneer attempt the work deserves recognition as a systematic and conscientious treatment of a little known and difficult subject.

THE JOURNAL OF THE UNITED PROVINCES HISTORICAL SOCIETY

As we see him through Dr. Pandey's work, Abhinava appears as the meeting-point of many lines of thought of many philosophical and religious traditions which he welds together into a definite philosophy that comprehends a large horizon of ideas. The reconstruction of such a personality is like the discovery of Greek thought at the beginning of Renaissance in Europe. A task of this dimension demands bold and profound scholarship as also deep insight into the currents, cross-currents and under currents of thought in those dim days. As we read through the pages of the work, we find in each line the evidence of a subtle intellect that refuses to be baffled by intellectual problems.

THE JOURNAL OF ÆSTHETICS AND ART CRITICISM, U. S. A.

Spring 1964

Now Professor Pandey has carried his monumental series one step farther by a separate volume on Abhinavagupta, who is widely regarded as India's greatest æsthetician. He provides

much unfamiliar information on that medieval philosopher's theory of poetry and drama (pp. 107ff, 115ff, 244ff). Abhinavagupta's practical experience in theatrical and musical activity is shown as a source and basis for his theories. Most of the volume is, however, concerned with the religious and philosophic aspects of his life and teachings, especially as related to Śaivism (the worship of Shiva) and the Krama and Kula systems of philosophy.

BULLETIN OF THE SCHOOL OF ORIENTAL AND AFRICAN STUDIES

University of London W. C. 1

The publication of this revised and enlarged edition of Professor Pandey's pioneering and fundamental study of the works of Abhinavagupta, the leading figure in Kāśmīr Śaiva literature, may serve to remind scholars how little has been done, in the 27 years since the first edition appeared, to pursue the study of āgamic literature and to integrate the ideas which it embodies with those of the better known darśana literature.

Further study of the points of contact and divergence in the 3 systems promises to be of capital importance for the understading of the development of Indian religion and philosophy.

THE CALCUTTA REVIEW

October, 1963

The present book is the Second edition of Dr. Pandey's Abhinavagupta. It is an instance of rare scholarship and remarkable academic achievement. It is the outcome of many years of close, careful and conscientious study of the life of Abhinavagupta and his rare and mostly unpublished works on the Tantra, poetics and philosophy. These works are not widely known among students and scholars of the present day, but they are very important for a thorough understanding of the subjects dealt with in them. Professor Pandey has rendered a real service to the cause of education and the advancement of learning by publishing this valuable volume on Abhinavagupta.

THE VISVABHARATI QUARTERLY

Number 3, 1962–63

Reader of the V. B. Quarterly are acquainted with the first edition of this valuable book. Dr. Pandey has spent years in the study of the life and works of Abhinavagupta and is now a recognised authority on the subject. The volume under review bears witness to Dr. Pandey's devoted and mature scholarship.

We wish Dr. Pandey, the pioneer scholar in this special and very important field of Indian culture, would continue to make the abstruse teachings of the Kashmir masters available to the general reader.

COMPARATIVE ÆSTHETICS VOL. I.

INDIAN ÆSTHETICS

WITH A FOREWORD BY

PROF. S. RADHAKRISHNAN

Revised Editinon.

This Edition presents a more complete picture of Indian Æsthetics than that given in the first Edition. Thus, it includes chapters on the History and Philosophy of Music and Architecture, the two arts, which alone, besides poetry, are recognised to be independent or fine in the Indian tradition and, therefore, fall within the purview of a work on Indian Æsthetics. It throws light on some important problems such as the following :—

(i) Poetry is the highest form of art ; drama is the highest form of poetry ; and tragedy is the highest form of drama. Why did not the tragic form of drama develop in Sanskrit ?

(ii) What is the difference between the two experiences, Karuṇa and tragic ?

(iii) Did the ancient Indian stage employ curtains, presenting scenes of action, and artistic imitations of inanimate and animate objects, such as chariots and horses.

(iv) Why is there more dialogue than action in Sanskrit drama ?

This Edition contains thirteen chapters.

Chapter I. History of Indian Æsthetics.

The first discusses the meaning of Æsthetics. It surveys the history of Indian Æsthetics in the context of dramaturgy from Brahma-Bharata to Bhaṭṭa Nāyaka. It deals with the religious origin of drama. It shows how some of the modern problems of æsthetics have been handled by Bharata, e. g. æsthetic senses : the end of the dramatic art : the importance of women on the stage : the æsthetic object : the importance of scenery in dramatic presentation : psycho-physical conditions, necessary in the

spectator, for æsthetic experience. It discusses theories of art such as imitation, illusion, inference and Katharsis.

Chapter II. The S'aiva Basis of Abhinava's Æsthetics.

The second presents the fundamentals of the monistic Śaiva philosophy of Kashmir, on which Abhinavagupta's philosophy of art is based. It shows how Abhinavagupta has put the æsthetic experience at the second transcendental level of experience (Ānanda or Śakti) which a yogin reaches in Vyatireka Turīyātīta samādhi.

Chapter III. Abhinavagupta's Theory of Æsthetics.

The third is primarily concerned with the presentation of Abhinavagupta's theory of Æsthetics. It deals exhustively with the subjective conditions, necessary for the æsthetic experience aroused by Drama, such as taste, æsthetic susceptibility, power of visualisation, contemplative habit and capacity to identify. It shows how five recognised levels in æsthetic experience, (1) sense, (2) imagination, (3) emotion, (4) Katharsis and (5) transcendency are reached through the medium of dramatic presentation.

Chapter IV. Types of Rasa.

The fourth discusses different views on the types of Rasa and attempts to answer the questions : Does Bhavabhūti admit Karuṇa to be the only Rasa ? Does Bhoja recognise Śṛṅgāra to be the only Rasa ? It presents the approaches of Bhānudatta, Dhanañjaya, Bhaṭṭa Lollaṭa, Abhinavagupta etc. to the problem of the number of Rasas. It points out the basic emotional difference of the nine Rasas from one another and attempts to establish Śānta as an independent Rasa. It refutes the view that Vātsalya, Laulya and Bhakti are independent Rasas and divides Rasas into basic and dependent.

Chapter V. Abhinavagupta's Theory of Meaning.

The fifth establishes the distinction of the suggestible meaning from the conventional, secondary and contextual meanings on psycological grounds and shows that psychology of meaning is the basis of classification of the suggestible.

Chapter VI. Mahimabhaṭṭa's Criticism of Dhvani.

The sixth presents Mahima Bhaṭṭa's criticism of the theory of the suggestible meaning (Dhvani), propounded by Ānanda Vardhana, and a reply to it by Ruyyaka. It throws light on the personality of Mahima Bhaṭṭa ; shows that he was a follower of the monistic Śaiva School of Kashmir and not of the Nyāya or the Vaiśeṣika, and deals with his Anumeyārthavāda in the proper setting of his philosophy.

Chapter VII. The Technique of Sanskrit Drama.

The seventh deals with the ways and means of dramatisation and explains their psychological value in giving rise to the æsthetic experience. It shows how the unities of time, place and action are maintained in Sanskrit Drama and why there is no tragedy in Sanskrit in the strict 'Shakespearian' sense of the term.

Chapter VIII. Types of Drama.

The eighth discusses the ten basic forms of dramatic composition and points out the basis of their distinction from one another. It refers to the principle of production of the dependent forms of drama, such as Toṭaka, Saṭṭaka, Rāsaka etc.

Chapter IX. Essentials of Sanskrit Dramatic Presentation.

The ninth is concerned with the presentation of the essentials of dramatic presentation, such as action, acting, theatrical convention, regional manners and customs etc. It discusses the different meanings given to the word Vṛtti by poeticians, grammarians and dramaturgists, and different views on the number of Vṛttis. It presents four types of action and acting and shows how Sanskrit dramaturgists emphasise the importance of psychological action and its representation in acting in dramatic presentation. It gives different opinions on the presentation of death on the stage and attempts to prove that dramas in ancient India were staged in the open air as well as in the duly constructed theatre.

Chapter X. Æsthetic Currents in Poetics.

The tenth surveys the history of poetics in India and shows how the conception of poetry slowly evolved till, in the final stage, Rasa, which was established as the soul of Drama, is recognised to be the soul of poetry also.

Chapter XI. Art of Music (Saṅgīta Kalā).

The eleventh traces the history and evolution of the art of music from the Sāmavedic time to the current century. It shows how the well recognised seven notes evolved out of the original three : what distinct contributions were made during the times of the Brāhmaṇas and the Sūtras : how by the time of the Mahābhārata the distinction between the Sāmavedic and the Classical notes disappeared. It justifies the view that Rāgas were known to Bharata. It gives a detailed account of the writers on classical music from the pre-Bharata time to that of Bhātkhaṇḍe and points out the factors, responsible for the rise of the two distinct schools of Indian music, Southern and Northern.

Chapter XII. Philosophy of Music.

The twelfth traces the development of the Philosophy of Music from the time of the Chāndogya Upaniṣad to the present day. It discusses the following problems : what is the ultimate origin of the musical notes : what is the nature of experience that music arouses at higher æsthetic levels : how the power of effective production of musical notes is acquired : why music as a means to grasp the Ultimate Reality is preferable to the practice of Yoga : what are influences which have been responsible for the development of the Philosophy of Music ? It presents the Philosophy of Music as propounded by Abhinavagupta, Śārṅgadeva, Nāgeśa Bhaṭṭa and the Siddhānta Śaiva Dualism.

Chapter XIII. Art of Architecture or Vāstukalā.

The thirteenth deals with the sources of information on architecture, such as the Vedas, Brāhmaṇas, Sūtras, Buddhistic Piṭakas, Purāṇas, Śaivāgamas etc. and with the three architectural traditions in India, (i) Śaiva, (ii) Brāhma and (iii) Māya. It

shows how the Indian architectural tradition spread as far as Central America through Central Asia and the Indian Archipelago. It discusses why painting and sculpture are not recognised to be independent or fine arts, but are admitted to be dependent on or subordinate to architecture. It briefly presents the philosophy of architecture or Vāstu-Brahma-Vāda, points out the nature of æsthetic experience from a work of architecture and concludes with a summary-view of the Absolutist Indian philosophy of Fine Art.

In support of the statements made in the book, relevant passages from the original Sanskrit texts, both in print and in Mss., are given in the Appendix.

SELECT OPINIONS AND REVIEWS.

Prof. S. Radhakrishnan.

His work deals with a relatively unexplored section of Indian thought and his handling of the original sources and sympathetic interpretation of Æsthetic doctrines are remarkable. No student of Indian Æsthetics can afford to neglect this important work.

Prof. Edgar S. Brightman, U. S. A.

It is a very careful piece of scholarship. Any one who desires to become acquainted with Indian Æsthetic theory in its early (and permanent) forms will have to rely on your work if he cannot use the primary sources. I am impressed with the richness of Indian thought, although rather surprised at the lack of development over so long a period.

Dr. S. K. De, M. A., D. Litt., Calcutta.

It is a good and interesting work ; and the most valuable part of your contribution is exposition of Abhinavagupta's standpoint.

Rajasevasakta A. R. Wadia., Pro. Vice-Chancellor, University of Baroda.

He has done the work remarkably well, and practically broken virgin ground. No student of Æsthetics can be anything but most grateful to him for the hidden lore, that he has made

so easily accessible to all interested in the subject. It fills up a long-felt gap.

Prof. L. Renou, University of Paris.

The work is a very profound one.......I think that no body has been so deeply acquainted with Abhinavagupta as you are. You are also the first at least to such an extent to deal with the connection between philosophy and Æsthetics.

The Journal of Ganganath Jha Research Institute.

The present volume is mainly concerned with the presentation of 'Abhinavagupta's theory of Æsthetics against the background of the history of Æsthetic thought in India and in proper setting of the system of the monistic Śaiva philosophy of Kashmir'.

All the topics have been critically and chronologically dealt with. The author has explained the facts in a lucid and interesting manner. His exposition is quite good.

Prof. W. E. Hocking, Harvard University.

Such a work, with its full historical background, has long been wanted. Your emphasis on drama is enlightening. You are right in giving much weight to Hegel as a philosophical exponent of western Æsthetics whose contrast with Indian thought on this subject is instructive.

Prof. S. N. Dasgupta, C. I. E., I. E. S., Ph. D., D. Litt.

It is an excellent work on the theory of Rasa and contains an excellent treatment of Abhinavagupta's theory of literary judgement in association with his theory of Śaiva philosophy.

Prof. Charles Morris, University of Chicago.

I enjoyed very much the discussion of meaning in Vol. I of your fine work, Comparative Æsthetics. The concept of Dhvani is especially valuable, since it deals with an aspect of meaning that has been neglected in Western theories. I called attention to your work in my seminar this Summer.

Philosophy East and West, University of Hawaii. U. S. A.

K. C. Pandey's work entitled Indian Æsthetics is actually the first of three volumes, all of which are to appear under the

general title Comparative Æsthetics. Volume II is to be concerned with 'æsthetic currents in the West' and Volume III with a 'detailed comparison of the views of Indian and European Æstheticians.' Such a three-volume work could well be a notable contribution to comparative æsthetics, being, as it is, without comparable precedent.

Presidential Address, 16th All-India Oriental. Conference.

I am glad to find Lucknow University occupying a place in the front rank with......Dr. K. C. Pandey's......Comparative Æsthetics Vol. I.

Sri K. K. Handiqui, Vice-Chancellor, Gauhati. University

Amidst the steadily growing literature on Sanskrit Poetics an outstanding contribution is Dr. K. C. Pandey's Comparative Æsthetics.

Dr. Bhagavan Das, Bharat Ratna, Banaras.

Dr. K. C. Pandey, author of philosophical works of a high order such as Abhinavagupta and Indian Æsthetics..........

The Journal Asiatique, University of Paris.

Ce volume est le premier d'une trilogie qui comprendra une "Esthétique occidentale" et une "Comparaison entre les esthétiques de l' Inde et de l' occident." Il prolonge en quelque sorte le livre publié parl' auteur il y a une quinzaine d' années sur Abhinavagupta, philosophe et poéticien. L' objet en est double : présenter les thèses d' esthétique d' Abhinavagupta dans leur cadre historique. et pour ce faire résumer l' ensemble des systèmes de rhétorique et de dramaturgie depuis les origines saisissables jusqu' au xi^{e} siècle. D' autre part, montrer comment la poétique d'Abhinavagupta est solidaire de sa philosophie, comment, d' une manière plus générale, les deux domaines sont en étroite connexion. Vaste et difficile sujet; l' œuvre d' Abhinvaagupta, inédite en grande partie, est d' un acces particulièrement sévère ; rares sont, même dans I' Inde, ceux qui s' y sont risques.

L' impartance de l' ourvage de M. Pandey reside avant tout dans son effort pour retracer les speculations sous-jacentes aux theories dramaturgiques.

Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies University of London W. C. 1.

Since all detailed comparison between Indian and Western (Vol. II) æsthetics has been reserved for a third volume, the projected Comparative Æsthetics cannot yet be judged as a whole. The project has been welcomed in India, Europe, and America, and there is no need to comment further on its originality and boldness or on the value of the Indian volume.

THE JOURNAL OF ÆSTHETICS AND ART CRITICISM

Summer 1961.

It must be regarded as a landmark in opening up Indian æsthetics to Western scholars. It contains many suggestive insights which have not yet been fully taken into account by Western æstheticians. Pandey's third volume, comparing Indian and Western æsthetics, is awaited with interest.

THE CULCUTTA REVIEW

October, 1959.

In this book the author treads an almost untrodden path, and that with full equipment and confidence. The value of his work in these lines can hardly be overestimated. I have nothing but praise for the learned author's wide knowledge of the original sources, and careful and clear interpretation of æsthetic doctrines. The need for a second edition of the book within a short time after the publication of the first, is an evidence for its great popularity and usefulness. The book is an outstanding contribution to the literature on Indian Æsthetics in English.

THE VISVABHARATI QUARTERLY

Kanti Chandra Pandey has earned the gratitude of the world of scholarship by bringing out this enlarged edition of his erudite work on Indian Æsthetics, which, with its companion volume on Western Æsthetics, has already become classical in the field of Comparative Æsthetics.

A life long student of the versatile Abhinavagupta, the great Śaiva philosopher and æsthete of Kashmir, whose works he has edited, translated and interpreted in his many earlier works, Dr. Pandey is a great example of how the intensive study of one master mind can gradually, but solidly, expand the scholar's interest, erudition and insight in all connected field. His present work, like the other ones, provides a treasure-house for the students of literature, æsthetics, psychology and philosophy. Even a modern student of Semantics will find here some of the profoundest discussions on the subject by Indian thinkers, particularly the Śaiva thinkers of Kashmir. Critical comparisons of Indian views with their Western analogues show the wide scholarship of the author, and also enhances the value of the book.

COMPARATIVE ÆSTHETICS VOL. II.

WESTERN ÆSTHETICS

The book is divided into Fourteen Chapters. It deals with such Western æsthetic thinkers only as have marked similarity with the Indian. Majority of æstheticians have been influenced in their theories of art by their metaphysical, epistemic, psychological and ethical views. Relevant aspects of the philosophy of each thinker, therefore, have been given as the background of his æsthetic theory.

At the beginning of each chapter, the points of similarity between the æsthetic theory of a particular author, dealt with in it, and that of an Indian æsthetician, discussed in the first volume, 'Indian Æsthetics', have been clearly presented. This volume, thus, presents the high lights of the Western Æsthetics, which are important from a comparative point of view.

Chapter I. Background of Æsthetic Theory of Plato.

It discusses the meaning of 'æsthetics' and gives an account of the æsthetic thought of the pre-Platonic æsthetic thinkers such as Gorgias and Socrates.

Chapter II. Rigoristic Hedonism of Plato.

It points out that Plato accepted the view of Sophist Gorgias that art creates illusion and, therefore, in spite of his fine æsthetic sense, was compelled to refuse it a place in his ideal Republic, because in the light of his philosophy he found that it is irrational all round and, therefore, does not strengthen the mind but corrupts it. This is the theory of Art as presented in the Republic. But in his Laws he seems to allow all arts, as sources of pleasure, to live in the ideal Republic, provided their exhibitions are strictly regulated and are used, not for the mere satisfaction of sensuous desires but for encouraging people in moderation. His theory is, therefore, called Rigoristic Hedonism.

Chapter III. Pedagogism of Aristotle.

It is primarily concerned with the presentation of Aristotle's view of tragedy and points out that Plato's condemnatory view of art, as presented in his famous Republic, could not be accepted by the general public, because it is extremely tender towards art. Aristotle, therefore, looked for a compromise, the way to which had already been paved by Plato himself in his Laws, Book II. This compromise took the form of the well known pedagogic theory of art. It is presented in the context of his famous definition of tragedy and is closely related to his ethical theory of the 'mean', because, according to him, tragedy improves the spectator morally.

It discusses the meaning, means, manner and object of imitation, the essential nature and sources of action and of tragic emotions, and the tragic error. It presents the various types of Katharsis in historical perspective together with the Kathartic tradition as found in the works of Plato and refers to the influences which shaped the Aristotelian doctrine of Katharsis which accounts for the ethical effect of tragic presentation on spectator.

Chapter IV. Dramatic Technique.

It presents a logical analysis of tragedy, according to quality and quantity. It deals with ornament of spectacle, diction, song, manners, sentiment, action, fable, prologue, chorus, episode and exode. It shows how Aristotle divided the subject-matter of drama into presentable and unpresentable and explains the unities of time, place and fable.

Chapter V. Mysticism of Plotinus in The Context of Æsthetics.

It shows how, according to Plotinus, æsthetic experience is beyond the emotive level and belongs to the transcendental level in so far as it is 'akin' to the mystic experience of the Ultimate, the One, and explains the analogy implied by 'akin' in terms of his metaphysics. It points out the distinction of the Plotinic conception of Katharsis from the Aristotelian. It discusses the

relation between art and reality and morality and shows that art is not imitation nor is beauty symmetry and that æsthetic experience is recognitive.

Chapter VI. Æsthetic Currents in Early Christian Era, Middle Ages and Renaissance.

It discusses St. Augustine's defence of poetry, his peculiar conception of artistic falsehood, the place of ugly in art and the aim of poetry according to him. It shows what is the ground of attraction in art, what is the definition of beauty, which are the æsthetic senses and how there is quiescence of desire in æsthetic experience, according to St. Thomas. It presents the views of Renaissance thinkers that imitation and imagination are the means of artistic production; that imitation means 'verisimilitude'; that art is human invention; that emotion is the principle of harmony in art and that pleasure from art is essentially intellectual. Durer's conception of art and Fracastoro's idea of æsthetic experience also are presented here.

Chapter VII. Intellectualistic Æsthetics of Descartes.

It presents Descartes' theory of emotion in respect of organ, process, mechanism, movement of blood and animal spirit and the condition of heart, involved in different emotions, and the language as the cause. It deals with his division of emotions into primary and dependent, their external signs and voluntary and involuntary physical changes in which they find expression. His views on fable and poetry; his division of joy as a passion into various kinds such as sensuous, imaginative, intellectual and æsthetic; his conception of intellectual joy from poetry and of æsthetic experience as confused thought; his explanation of æsthetic experience from tragedy and his differentiation between the pure joy and the æsthetic, between good and beautiful and between evil and ugly find their due place here.

Chapter VIII. British Æsthetic Thinkers.

It presents (i) Bacon's view that creative imagination distorts nature: (ii) Hobbes' view that it visualises the end and the means, relates and finds out not only similarities but differences also; and his conception of genious and of identification in the

context of art : (iii) Locke's view that beauty is complex idea, which can be brought under mixed mode, and his conception of inner sense, of taste and genius and of æsthetic experience as pleasant deception : (iv) Addison's view that imagination receives lively ideas from external object, retains them, selects and organises the selected into pleasanter whole ; that æsthetic experience involves self-forgetfulness or change of personality and that though it is a delusion yet it is without the consciousness of it as such : (v) Burke's distinction of the æsthetic judgement from the logical in his conception of taste ; his view that a work of art affects the mind of the spectator exactly as an object of nature and that poetry and drama present emotion ; and his conception of 'sublime' : (vi) Berkeley's view that beauty belongs to the sphere of feeling involving reason and that the ultimate source of beauty is God : (vii) Hume's compromise with rationalism ; his utilitarian rationalism in his treatment of the problem of art; his view that beauty is not real ; that it is individual and not universal ; that æsthetic experience consists in agreeable sentiment or passion, which is aroused by symmetry and proportion in the object of perception and that it is unselfish and involves identification.

Chapter IX. Æsthetic Currents in Germany.

It deals with (i) Leibniz's view that beauty is nothing but harmony, though capable of including apparent contradiction; that there are different levels in æsthetic experience and that at the highest level æsthetic experience is the experience of the universal harmony through its symbolic presentation in art: (ii) Baumgarten's recognition of æsthetic experience as confused perception; his contribution in the form of adding to the Wolffian division of theoretical sciences another science, which he called 'Æsthetic' for the first time; and his conception of matter and value of art, of poetry and perfection in it, of art as imitation and of distinction between beauty and truth.

Chapter X. Transcendental Æsthetics of Kant.

It shows how æsthetics evolved in Kant's mind, how he criticises his predecessors and what advance he makes on them.

It presents the problem of the Critique of Judgement, its solution and the technique that he employs. It discusses the different types of imagination and understanding, according to him, and his conception of taste and genius. It distinguishes beautiful from pleasant and good, shows how æsthetic judgement is disinterested, universally valid, purposive without purpose and necessary; and deals with his theory of sublime.

Chapter XI. Absolutist Æsthetics of Hegel.

It presents Hegel's view that a work of art is not primarily addressed to senses but to the mind; connosseur, therefore, associates himself with it without any craving such as one has for a sensuous object of desire and relates himself with it as with an object which is reflective of himself, which, like a mirror, gives reflection of certain moments of the life of self and the satisfaction from the artistic relation with which is purely spiritual satisfaction, due to self-recognition in the reflection of the self in a work of art, through contemplation. It discusses art as a phase of the Absolute Spirit, the meaning of 'æsthetics' in Hegel, the place of art in his system and the end of artistic production. It deals with his criticism of different theories of art such as imitation and of the ends of art such as purification and instruction. It gives his division of art into subjective, objective and absolute from the point of view of the content; into architecture, sculpture, painting, music and poetry from the point of view of the material medium, and into symbolic, classical and romantic from the point of view of relation between content and form. It touches upon his division of poetry into epic, lyric and dramatic; his theory of tragedy and his interpretation of Aristotelian unities.

Chapter XII. Voluntaristic Æsthetics of Schopenhauer.

It presents Schopenhauer's view that æsthetic experience is the experience of 'Idea', the immediate manifestation of the Will, free from all relations; that it is attained when knowledge is free from the service of will and the subject also is free from all elements of individuality; that it is a transcendental experience, because the apprehension of the æsthetic object transcends the forms of human intellect, time, space and causality;

that it is got intuitively when a connoisseur contemplates on a beautiful work of art, rising above the individuality, both subjective and objective, and, therefore, becoming a pure will-less subject; when he rises into the object, ceasing to consider the when, the where, the why and the whither of things and looks at simply and solely the what. It deals with his conception of the 'Idea' as the object of art, genius, imagination, æsthetic contemplation and disinterestedness of æsthetic experience.

Chapter XIII. Intuitive Æsthetics of Croce.

It deals with Croce's criticism of Hegel's philosophy in general and of his theory of fine art in particular. It presents his view that 'Æsthetic' is the first theoretic form; that it is marked by the absence of distinction between subject and object and by freedom from temporal and spatial limitations; that it is a pure subjective experience, free from even the predicative relation and that it is an intuition without any intellectual element. It discusses the characters of Hamlet and Iago in the light of Croce's conception of practical spirit and economic will respectively. It throws light on such problems as what is art, what is the relation between content and form in art and what constitutes the unity of art.

Chapter XIV. A Comparative Survey of Indian and Western Æsthetics.

It discusses the meaning of 'Kalā' (Art) and presents the antiquity of art-tradition in India and the relation of arts with Śaivaism and appetitive objective of human life (Kāma). It gives the list of Sixty-four arts, found in the Śaiva Tantra and the Kāma Sūtra of Vātsyāyana. It deals with the classification of arts into basic and dependent, according to an earlier authority than Vātsyāyana, Pāñcāla, who maintained the number of the basic arts to be Sixty-four and that of the dependent arts to be Five Hundred and Eighteen. It points out the distinction between Hegelian and Indian classification of arts and states the two points of view for handling the problem of art, different approaches to the problem of æsthetics and the principles of artistic production such as imitation, reflection, illusion, selec-

tive imitation, idealisation, invention, verisimilitude, symbolisation, concretisation and suggestion. It approaches the problem of suggestion from the logical and the psychological points of view and shows that æstheticians in both the East and the West have recognised emotion to be an essential element in the æsthetic experience from poetry or drama and that there is difference of views on æsthetic experience of fear. It presents the views of Locke, Addison, Burke and Hegel on the said subject with necessary criticism and concludes with Abhinavagupta's explanation.

The detailed treatment of the points of similarity in the æsthetic thoughts of Indian and Western æstheticians is the subject-matter of the Third Volume 'Indian and Western Æsthetics'.

SELECT OPINIONS AND REVIEWS.

Dr. S. Radhakrishnan,

It is a valuable work.

Prof. I. A. Richards, U. S. A.

It certainly appears to be most comprehensive.

Prof. L. Renou, University of Paris.

It is probably the first time an Indian scholar devotes such a research to our æsthetics.

Prof. Charles Morris, University of Chicago.

It is really surprising how many parallels you show between Western and Indian æsthetic theory. It will be interesting to see the detailed comparison in Vol. III.

Prof. J. Brough, School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London.

I shall find it a very useful work of reference in future.

Philosophy and Phenomenological Research, University of Buffalo, U. S. A.

The book is essentially an exposition of the views of Plato, Aristotle, Plotinus, Descartes, Kant, Hegel, Schopenhauer and Croce. The author allots considerable space to a routine, elementary account of the philosophical framework in terms of

which each of these thinkers wrote about art. What is most interesting, therefore, to a Western reader are the few observations made about Indian æsthetics.

The Journal of Æsthetics and Art Criticism, Western Reserve University, U. S. A.

The present volume, as the title suggests, is a survey of western æsthetics. For western readers, though, its primary interest may lie more in its indication of Indian thought than in its discussions of Western theories. Though Dr. Pandey states that the book deals only with those western theories which have a marked similarity to Indian thought, the range of Indian æsthetic theory may be indicated by the fact that nearly every major Western writer from Plato to Hegel is at least mentioned and there are lengthy chapters on Plato, Aristotle, Plotinus, Descartes, Kant, Hegel, Schopenhauer and Croce.

The Visvabharati Quarterly, Santiniketan.

In this voluminous book the learned Professor has offered us critical exposition of such Western æsthetic thought as has affinities with Indian thought......

But the main interest of this Volume lies in a lucid exposition of the fundamentals of æsthetic thought of a long line of brilliant thinkers of the West......

The author has dealt with each thinker with an eye on the historical background and influences so as to place each theory in its proper perspective. In order to fulfil this important condition of a fruitful comparative study he has to delve into the epistemological and metaphysical ideas implicit in each æsthetical theory and this thoroughness on his part has contributed to the work its richness and robust dignity.

The Calcutta Review.

The book under review is a lucid presentation of the æsthetic theories of the master minds of the West. Ranging from Gorgias (470 B. C.) and Socrates (467–399 B. C.) to Benedetto Croce (1866–1952) all the æsthetic theories as propounded by the continental and British thinkers have been critically evaluated and pitted against the corresponding Indian views...

The whole range of æsthetic thought as stated above has been put in the volume under review in a style of good grace and charming simplicity.

Vice-Chancellor's address before the annual meeting of the court, Lucknow University, 1957.

Noteworthy pieces of Creative work in this academic session are Dr. K. C. Pandey's Comparative Æsthetics Vol. II......

The Annals (B. O. R. Institute) Vol. XXXIX, Parts 1 & II, Poona, 1958.

Indian and Western students of Æsthetics will ever remain grateful to Dr. Pandey for the vast amount of material on the subject that he has placed before them for such comparative study. His comparison of the Greek theories of imitation in art and the theory of anukṛti in Bharata and his suggestion that this principle of imitation reveals the link between Religion and art in early human civilisation, opens out a valuable line of research in the subject of the historical development of æsthetic theories in relation to different epochs of human culture.

BHĀSKARĪ

VOL. III

AN ENGLISH TRANSLATION

OF

THE ĪS'VARA PRATYABHIJÑĀ VIMARS'INĪ

IN THE LIGHT OF THE BHĀSKARĪ

WITH

AN OUTLINE

OF

HISTORY OF S'AIVA PHILOSOPHY

The English Translation of the Īśvara Pratyabhijñā Sūtra of Utpalācārya and of the Vimarśinī, a commentary on it by Abhinavagupta, that is presented in this Volume, has a distinctive feature. The translation is neither too literal nor too liberal. It follows the 'mean' between the too extremes and gives within brackets (I) the original Sanskrit word where an English word is used in a wider than the ordinary accepted meaning (II) an explanatory note where the argument is difficult and (III) the connecting link where such a link seems to be implied, in the light of the Bhāskarī of Bhāskarakaṇṭha and the Īśvara Pratyabhijñā Vivṛti Vimarśinī of Abhinavagupta.

The importance of the Īśvara Pratyabhijñā Vimarśinī is well recognised. For, the Æsthetic Theory of Abhinavagupta can be clearly and correctly understood only in the light of the epistemic technique and the theory of manifestation (Ābhāsavāda) as given therein : and it is the only available complete work that fully presents Indian Voluntarism, which compares well with German Voluntarism as presented by Schopenhauer.

The Īśvara Pratyabhijñā Vimarśanī, which historically is the last of the available philosophical works of Abhinavagupta, presents the crowning phases of Śaiva Philosophy, if not of Indian Philosophy as a whole.

There are eight systems of Śaiva Philosophy which have been traced so far : (I) Pāśupata Dualism, (II) Siddhānta Śaiva Dualism, (III) Dualistic-cum-Monistic Śaivaism of Lakulīśa Pāśupata, (IV) Viśiṣṭādvaita Śaivaism of Śrīkaṇṭha, (V) Viśeṣādvaita Śaivaism of Śrīpati Paṇḍita, (VI) Voluntaristic Śaivaism of Nandikeśvara, (VII) Reseśvara Śaivaism and (VIII) Monistic Śaivaism of Kashmir. They represent different currents of the philosophical thought such as dualism, dualism-cum-monism, monism, qualified monism, idealism and voluntarism etc. The Śaiva Philosophy, thus, seems to be complete in itself and to have had an independent tradition.

An Outline of History of Śaiva Philosophy, in which these systems are briefly dealt with from the historical and the philosophical points of view, appears as the Introduction of the Bhāskarī Vol. III. It shows the logical relation of the different Śaiva systems. The original texts, on which the Outline is based, are given in the Appendix A.

SELECT OPINIONS

Prof. S. Radhakrishnan, Vice-President of the Indian Republic.

The book shows accurate learning and keen insight.

Sri K. M. Munshi, Rajyapal Uttara Pradesh.

It is one of the few books which have thrown light on Śaivaism.

Dr. Bhagawan Das, Banaras.

It is on a par with English translations of philosophical works of great German thinkers like Hegel and Schopenhauer.

Prof. L. Renou, University of Paris.

Excellent translation of the Vimarśinī, which will be an indispensable work for every student interested in Indian Philosophy.

Prof. William Ernest Hocking, Harvard University.

I can, of course, testify to the important place occupied by your work in the system of religious thought in India.

Prof. Charles Morris, University of Chicago.

It Presents Śaivaism with a rich and unsuspected fullness.

Prof. K. A. Nilakanta Sastri, University of Mysore.

An authoritative and complete exposition of the History of Śaiva Philosophical systems with precise and up-to-date references.

Prof. A. R. Wadia, Ex-Vice-Chancellor, University of Baroda.

It will be appreciated by the select students interested in Śaivaism.

Prof. Suryakanta, Hindu University, Banaras.

It is a work of sound scholarship and pleasant exposition and it will, no doubt, rank as a valuable piece of philosophical literature in India.

Presidential Address, 16th All-India Oriental Conference, Lucknow.

I am glad to find Lucknow University occupying a place in the front rank with......Dr. K. C. Pandey's Bhāskrī Voll. II which continues his good work on the interesting but little studied subject of Kashmir Śaivaism, and Comparative Æsthetics Vol. I.

Sri K. K. Handiqui, M. A. (Cal. et Oxon) Vice-Chancellor, Gauhati University.

The Bhāskarī is indispensable for the study of Abhinavagupta's Vimarśinī......Dr. Pandey's Introduction is very helpful......as it not only gives a lucid exposition of the basic concepts and the general background of Kashmir Śaiva philosophy but explains the points at issue between that system and other schools of thought, especially the Buddhists.

New Indian Antiquary.

The need for a traditional interpretation of this philosophy so long felt by the scholars has been at last fulfilled by the present commentary of Bhāskara published for the first time.

Journal Asiatique.

J'emprunte ces faits á l' excellent exposé liminaire qui complete celui figurant déjá au tome I.

Journal of the Mythic Society, Bangalore.

Students of Indian philosophy in general and Śaiva literature and philosophy in particular owe a debt of gratitude to the

author for his learned and almost pioneering lobours in the field. The 206 page introduction is scholarly and exhaustive and the translation is very carefully done and is on the whole a highly creditable performance.

Annals of the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute.

The English translation of the Kārikā and the Vimarśinī is preceded by an outline, extending over a little more than 200 pages, of the history of Śaiva philosophy. The first part of this outline deals mainly with the chronology and the literary activity of the principal authors belonging to the eight systems of Śaiva philosophy, while the second part embodies a comprehensive and, often, comparative-statement of the philosophical doctrines propounded by those systems......this outline constitutes an admirable conspectus of Śaiva philosophy in general and of the monistic Śaivaism of Kashmir in particular.

Dr. Pandey deserves to be warmly congratulated on having accomplished, through the publication of the three Volumes of the Bhāskarī, a magnificent literary project.